

CHAPTER 11

From *gazel* to *moiroloi*: the nationalizing of the *amanes*

Gail Holst-Warhaft [Cornell University]

Those of us who wrote about rebetika in the 1970s have been correctly criticised for reducing the complexity of the genre.¹ What we knew was what we heard in Athens at a certain period, what we heard from older performers who described the rebetika scene they had known and what Ilias Petropoulos and other Greek aficionados of rebetika told us. We might have found out more about Greek music in the early decades of the century by listening to recordings preserved in the United States or Istanbul, but we were interested in something that was still, in however attenuated form, alive when we observed it. It was something we regarded as an exclusively Greek phenomenon, centered on Piraeus, not on Istanbul or Smyrna, New York or Chicago. Now that scholars and collectors of records have pointed out our errors, it is time to reconsider not only how our image of rebetika has changed, but to what extent the music of the late Ottoman Empire was a multi-ethnic phenomenon, independent of language or nationalism.

The answer to the first question seems to me fairly straightforward. The more we hear of the music recorded by the earliest singers associated with rebetika, the more we realise that it is impossible to draw lines between genres. Record labels have been seized on as providing the only hard evidence genre and dating, but they are as vague and unreliable as any other source. In the end, our own ears are a better guide. Songs labeled “rebetiko” from the first two decades of the century can be anything from light cabaret songs to dark *zeibekika*. If we can still characterise the rebetika proper as popular songs of low life, sometimes with references to hashish smoking, we have to acknowledge that these songs formed only a small part of the repertoire of most professional musicians in the late Ottoman Empire. The remainder of their songs comprised a wide variety of genres including folk songs from Anatolia, the Greek Islands, Armenia, Romania and other parts of the Balkans, marches, waltzes, tangos and various types of popular song, as well as songs that came from the classical Ottoman repertoire, both secular and religious. Within this mix of genres, musical borrowings – melodies, rhythms, vocal and instrumental styles – were common.

The linguistic mix seems to have been as broad as the musical one. Bülent Aksoy (1998), Dino Pappas (1998), Steve Frangos (1994) and Martin Schwartz (1991), amongst others, have documented many examples of Turkish melodies sung with Greek words, or of Greek singers performing in Turkish or Armenian. Successful singers like Marika Papagika, and Achilleas Poulos recorded songs in Turkish, while Marika Politissa and Rosa Eskenazi sang Istanbul songs with Greek words. Amalia Baka and Victoria Hazan recorded songs in Greek and Turkish and Ladino in the United States from 1920 on. The mixture of languages and styles that continued to be popular in the Greek communities of the United States until the 1940s suggests a nostalgia for the multi-ethnic Asia Minor world that transcended nationalism. The Smyrna disaster and the 1922 exchange of population, which might have been expected to end the fluidity of exchange, did not immediately appear to affect the communities living in Athens or the United States. However, the popular demand for music that had its roots outside the Greek mainland did not go unchallenged. Even before the influx of refugees, Greek intellectuals and critics were divided on the issue of the “oriental” in Greek music. It was a subject that would continue to be debated into the 1960s. At the center of the debate, in its earliest phases, was a particular genre in the repertoire of the *café-aman*: the *amane* or *amanes*.

The *gazel*, or, as the Greek termed it, the *amanes* was the jewel in the repertoire of singers from Istanbul to Chicago, the piece that distinguished the musical sheep from the goats. The *amanes* demonstrated whether a singer had mastered the refined art of improvisation on the *makamlar* of the late Ottoman classical repertoire. The *makam* is usually characterised as a mode, but as Aksoy (1997:41) points out, this is somewhat misleading. The modal scale is not the only determinant of the improvisations performed in each *makam*. There are also melodic progressions (*seyir* in Turkish) that characterise the *makam* and include the emphasis on particular notes and whether the scale is ascending or descending.² Even when, under the influence of western European music, late Ottoman musicians used modal types called *minore* and *matzore*, this did not indicate that a song is written in major or minor key, rather that it was based on melodic material drawn from major or minor scales.

The *makam* might be thought of as a melodic progression with standard variations, developed over a long period of time by skilled musicians. On that already complex base, the vocalists and instrumentalists were expected to improvise. A vocal improvisation was termed *gazel*, an instrumental improvisation, *taksim*. This art of improvisation, in the Ottoman tradition, was highly refined. Singers would typically take a quatrain of the *Divan* literature, chose a *makam* that seemed to suit the lyric, and try to create a fresh composition that enhanced both the poetry and the underlying *makam*. To take an analogy from jazz, the *makam* might be said to represent not only the melody of the “standard” but its chordal progressions, worked out by a series of earlier performers and possibly written down. The jazz performer takes the material and makes his or her own variations into a completely new composition into which fragments of the underlying melodic and harmonic material are woven. The absence of the “vertical” element of harmony in the Ottoman tradition means that variation is dependent on exquisite subtleties of tone and pitch.

Within the genre of *amanes* there are various sub-groupings according to the musical mode of the particular *amanes* or to a song type such as Tzivaeri, Galata, or Tabahaniotiko. Since each *makam* is not a scale but a group of melodic passages in one or more tone levels, the particular *makam* will dictate the melodic contour of each *amanes*. We may also be able to speak of an association of a particular group of *makamlar* with *amanedhes*. Of the entire range of *makamlar*, the *sabah*, *nihavent*, *hijaz* and *huzam* seem to have been among the most commonly used by Greek singers. There are also sub-groupings of the *amanedhes* according to the rhythm of the introduction and finale which may be *tsifeteli*, *ballos*, *syrtos*, etc. In the faster rhythmic finales to the *amanedhes* there are even examples of tango and waltz that change the mood of the piece to something quite light-hearted, but that does not alter the fact that the dominant mood, at least of the Greek *amanedhes*, is tragic. In fact it may be a deliberate device to break the despairing tone of the piece.³

Most of the great performers of *gazel* in the early years of the twentieth century were male *hafiz*, or Koran reciters, but the genre also became popular with secular performers, male and female, Muslim and non-Muslim.⁴ All the singers whom we now think of as associated with what we call, for want of a more precise expression, the “Asia Minor Style” or the “Smyrneika” sang *amanedhes* as well as a variety of other songs. Unlike many of the later rebetika singers based in Piraeus, they were professional musicians with a wide repertoire of styles. Whether Greek, Turk, Armenian or Jew, the singers and musicians of the early twentieth century who worked in Istanbul, Smyrna or New York and had successful professional careers recorded folk songs, popular songs of the period – European, Turkish or Greek --, songs of low-life that were or would be called rebetika, and *amanedhes*. Singers who are now associated with the “oriental” style like Marika Papagika, for example, recorded more Greek folk songs (*kleftika* and other *dimotika*) than she did *amanedhes* and *Smyrneika*.⁵ This was not only because Papagika’s audience was largely Greek and Greek-American, but because singers of the time were expected to perform in all the popular styles of the day. The legendary Ottoman musician known as Deniz Kizi

Eftalya (“The Mermaid Eftalya”), born in Istanbul in 1891, whose father was born in Greece, and who was possibly the first woman to make a recording in Turkey, sang everything from classical Ottoman *gazel* to country and city folk songs to playful popular songs.⁶ The fact that Eftalya performed in the *cafés-chantants* of Istanbul may suggest that the line between the music performed in the *café-aman* and the *café-chantant* may be hazier than we think. It may be also be impossible to determine which of the popular songs of the early decades of the century can be called rebetika or proto-rebetika. Is it a question of subject matter? Of the tone of the piece? Of a prevalent rhythm.

It is easier, I think, to make a distinction between popular songs and traditional folk songs, and between both those and *amane*s. Within the category of *amane*s there are further subdivisions, but they constitute a distinctive genre, one that is initially not differentiated from the *gazel*. The use of the terms *gazel*, *manes*, *amane*s and *gazeli*, sometimes hyphenated on record labels suggests that at least in the early decades of the century there was no distinction between them (Aksoy, 1997:45). It was Greek commentators who, in the final decades of the 19th century, began to claim the *amane* or *amane*s as a Greek phenomenon. In order to do so, they had to provide the music with an ancient pedigree.

Debate over the origins and character of Greek folk music originally focused exclusively on regional or *dimotiki mousiki* but from the 1880s onwards urban music joined rural as part of the broader nationalist controversy.⁷ At the center of the discussion about urban music was a disagreement about the relative merits of the “Oriental” music performed in the *cafés-aman* and the “European” music of the *cafés-chantants*. This discussion needs to be placed against the background of a double-descended myth of nationalism that reflected a genuine ambiguity in the Greeks’ perception of themselves. On the one hand, what the *café-aman* music, especially the *amane*s, represented, was the oriental side of the modern Greek inheritance. On the other, in contrast to the light and superficial music of the *cafés-chantants*, it was recognised by many Greek intellectuals and musicians to be musically more profound and it expressed pathos and grief in a way that western European popular song did not.

Nikos Kazantzakis summarised this attitude perfectly in his description of the modern Greek character found in *O Morias* (Translated into English as “Journey to the Morea”):

In the taverns, at festivals, on holidays, when they have drunk a little, the small businessmen and infantry officers [of the Peloponnese], so logical and selfish, break into melancholy eastern *amane*s, into a sudden longing; they reveal a psyche completely different from their sober everyday one. A great treasure, a deep longing.....” (1965 [my translation], 325)

Kazantzakis continues his somewhat unflattering characterisation as follows:

What has the dual-descended modern Greek taken from his father, what from his mother?.. He is clever and shallow, with no metaphysical anxieties, and yet, when he begins to sing, a universal bitterness leaps up from his oriental bowels, breaks through the crust of Greek logic and, from the depths of his being, totally mysterious and dark, the Orient emerges. (Ibid:326)

Kazantzakis’s description of the Greek split personality reflects a dichotomy noted by many foreign observers of Greece, (See, for example, Leigh Fermor, 1966, 96-147, and Michael Herzfeld, 1987, chs 4 -5). Like all dichotomies, the division is a simplification but it is one that has been widely perceived in the Greek personality not only by outside observers but by Greeks themselves. As Herzfeld notes, the dichotomy is itself both a European notion and a literate device (1987:96). It tends to reinforce stereotypes,

especially about gender and the privileged position of the European versus the Oriental. Like many liberal intellectuals of his time, the European-educated Kazantzakis employs the device of the dichotomy not in order to privilege the Hellenic side of the Greek character, but to honor his maternal inheritance, the mysterious, dark and Oriental soul embedded in the otherwise pragmatic Greek personality.

Not surprisingly, in this context, Kazantzakis describes the “Neoellinas” as being “Digenes” (dual-descended, twy-born). Digenes Akritas, hero of the epic Byzantine poem and of numerous folk songs, is, in the epic version, the son of an Arab father and a Greek mother. But as Herzfeld (1987:104) remarks, in many of the folk song texts, he becomes the son not of an Oriental father but of mother who is of marginal or outsider status. As guardian or baron of the Byzantine Empire’s Mesopotamian borders, Akritas is geographically as well as socially marginalised. His feats of bravery, his capture by the Arab leader and ultimate recognition as a hero provided Greeks with an ideal myth of Greekness that was exploited by 19th century nationalists.⁸ Herzfeld compares the character of the redeemed outsider Digenes with the hero of the shadow puppet theater, Karagiozis, also a trickster figure, who successfully uses his wits to reverse his lowly status as a *raya* (chattel) of the Ottoman Empire. Both the ethnically ambiguous hero of the folk songs and epic poem and the low-born hero of the puppet theater triumph over their origins as well as their enemies. So the Digenes texts become an apt metaphor “for a nation struggling to obliterate a recent history that the tutelary West deemed degrading.” (Herzfeld, op. cit. 106)

The fashioning of Greek nationalism in the 19th century was achieved the under the gaze of a West that was so invested in the rebirth of an idealised Hellenism that it sent thousands of volunteers to fight for it. In response, Greeks were initially prepared to present an ideal image of themselves to their supporters. This did not mean that they were unaware of how little the image matched reality. The tension between the expectations of European philhellenism and the reality of an Ottoman/Byzantine past helped stereotype both the European and the Oriental as extreme poles of the Greek character. Besides the language question, folklore was probably the most important area in which issues of national purity and eclecticism were played out.⁹ Like the texts, music itself became the nexus of opposed views, and folklorists become leading figures in the struggle to claim folk song as the single most important link between ancient and modern Greece. The fact that many Greek folk songs conform to modal types described by ancient Greek theorists of music appeared to confirm a continuous tradition of melodic composition from the ancient to the modern period. The music of the Orthodox Church, which appeared to preserve some of the ancient modes, could also be invoked as an intermediary source.

One of the earliest attempts to claim the *amanes* as essentially Greek in Yiorgos Phaidros’s article, written in Smyrna in 1881 and entitled *Pragmateia peri tou Smyrneikou Mane i tou para archaiois Manero* (“Treatise on the Smyrneic *Manes* or what was known to the ancients as *Maneros*”). Phaidros traces the origin of the *amanes* to the ancient lament for Linos. Following Herodotus, he claims that Linos was called *Maneros* by the Egyptians.¹⁰ The lament, origin of song itself, was invented, according to Herodotus, to be sung in honor of the first Egyptian King’s son, whose name was *Maneros*. Phaidros links the ancient Greek song for Linos or *Ailinos* to modern Greek and Egyptian folk laments. His attempt to derive *manes* from *Maneros* is etymologically far-fetched and dictated by his desire to claim the genre as of Greek, via Egyptian lament rather than Turkish. His own hypothesis of the ancient origin of *manes* is, he assures us, a plausible one, as opposed to what must have been an alternative explanation in his day :

It is, on the other hand, absurd for anyone to call the contemporary *manethes* Turkish strains. They are clearly Greek strains that we have inherited from our forefathers and we must guard this inheritance forever. (1881:18)

Unlike Kazantzakis, who ascribes the “oriental” sound of the *amane* to the feminine side of the modern Greek character, Phaidros claims the *amanes* as exclusively Greek and inherited from the paternal line. Still more revealing of his nationalistic project are Phaidros’ comments on the nature of the Ottoman *makam*:

The Turks have various monotonous melodies called “*makamia*” which mostly belong to Arabia or Egypt. These usually begin with the exclamation “Yiar Aman!” which means “merciful beloved” or “have mercy”. Some foolish people added the letters *es* to the word Aman, and then left off the initial *a*, forming the word Manes. But among the Ottomans, neither the word *amanes* nor Manes occurred, nor did they sing the strain in the Minor key (*Minore*). The aforementioned Aman Yiar remains, according to the opinion of the writer, inexplicable and cannot be categorised. (op. cit. 20)

In this passage Phaidros shows himself to be both musically illiterate and chauvinistic, but his remarks throw some light on the Greek perception of *amanes* that persists in the controversy surrounding Asia Minor style music. The combination of highly melismatic vocal style with lyrics that were often despairing caused the *gazel/ amanes* to be associated with lament, at least in the Greek perception. As a type of lament, the genre was automatically linked, by association, to Greek folk lament, a feminine genre. This does not mean to say that *amanedhes* were necessarily sung by women, as we know from numerous male recordings, but that they were well-suited to the female voice and its particular affective qualities.

Kazantzakis had ascribed the *amanes* or “song of bitter grief” to the modern Greek’s oriental and maternal inheritance. Just as the mother, rather than the father of Digenes Akritas becomes the outsider or marginal figure in the folk song tradition, so the dark, mysterious, oriental strain of the Greek character is linked to the feminine through the traditionally feminine art of lament. It is women who sing the laments for the dead in most “traditional” societies, and not only women who are the immediate kin of the deceased, but those who are regarded to be especially skilled in the art of expressing the pain of the community in an artful song.¹¹ In Greece, as a number of researchers have observed (See Alexiou (1974), Auerbach (1987), Caraveli Chaves (1980, 1986), Seremetakis (1991), Holst-Warhaft (1992)) both laments (*moirologhia*) and the women who sing them (*moirologhistres*) are regarded with some ambiguity. They may be regarded as essential at the time of death, but otherwise they are often avoided, even shunned by Greek men. Moreover, there is a long line of thought in Greek, beginning in antiquity and continuing through the Byzantine period that associates lament, especially excessive lament, not only with the female, but with the oriental, i.e. with Asia Minor. (See Johansen, 1980, Holst-Warhaft, 1992, Pollux 4.7) This long association appears to be reflected in the controversy about *amanedhes* in the Athenian Press summarised by Theodoros Hatzpantazis (1986, Gauntlett, 1987, 1989). In the debate that centered on the Greekness or otherwise of music performed in the *cafés-aman*, the term “oriental music” as Gauntlett notes, is often synonymous with *amanes*. As the musical form in which the “oriental”, i.e. the lamenting (female) voice is showcased, the *amanes* stands for what is, according to which side of the debate the writer is on, the least or the most Greek in the Asia Minor repertoire. The debate highlights the ambiguity that Greeks, more precisely Greek men, feel towards what Kazantzakis saw as the oriental and female side of their own inheritance.

In Phaidros’ article about the *manes*, it is curious that that the first example he uses to support his assertion that the *mane* or *amanes* is derived from ancient Greek lament is, in fact, another form dominated in the Greek folk tradition, by women. It is a lullaby that he says was still being sung in Smyrna at the time he was writing his article:

Na mou kamni naniiii nani to moro mou naniiii
O ilios vgain eis ta bouna

k ai perdike eis ta dasi....
(1) koimisou (2) chaidemenon mou
ton yponon na chortaso
E to moro mou, e, e, e, e, e, e.
Koimisou glykeron mou fos
k i moira sou douleuei (2)
kai to kalon sou rizikon
soi koubalei kai fernei e,e,e,e,e.,
O ypnos to parakalei,
k' ekeino den koimatai
exei ta matia t anoixta
kai to buzi enyumatai
E to moro mou e, e, e, e [etc].

So my baby can go bye-bye
The sun comes out on the mountains
and the partridges from the forests
(1) Sleep (2) my dearest
so you'll have all the sleep you want.
Eh, my baby, eh, eh, eh, eh.
Sleep my sweetest light
While your Fate does it work
and brings you good fortune, eh, eh, eh, eh
Sleep calls him
and he doesn't sleep;
his eyes are open
and he remembers the breast.
Eh, my baby, eh, eh, eh, eh, eh
[op. cit. examples p. 1-2]

Phaidros may have chosen his example simply for the repeated “e” sounds, but there is interesting support for his association of lullaby with laments and with *amanedhes* in general in a recording by Marika Politissa made in Athens between 1929 and 1931 on the Odeon label. The title given is the original Turkish title “Nini”, and it is designated as a *manes*:

Ooo ...Ach
koimisou orfano paidi
kai dakrua mi chyneis
aman
stin tyxi sou itan grafto
orfano na min eisai
aman
koimisou orfano moro
naaaani

Ooh! AAh!
Sleep, orphan children
and don't you cry
aman!
It wasn't written in your fate
aman!
for you to be an orphan
aman!
Sleep, orphan baby

hush-a-byeeee!¹²

The association of lullaby with lament is not unique to Greece. In the Finnish-speaking area of Karelia, formerly occupied by Russia and later the Soviet Union, lament/lullabies were common for girl children, whose inevitably miserable lives were considered a fate worse than death. (Nenona-Kalio, 1982:101) Similarly laments for brides, usually sung by their mothers and female relatives are a common phenomenon not only in Greece but in China and many other societies. What emerges from the cross-cultural comparative studies of laments is that with very few exceptions, they, like lullabies and most other songs that mark rites of passage or stages in the life cycle, are not only women's songs but associated with a certain emotional intensity that may be admired, even sought out by men in times of crisis but at other times may also be considered non-masculine, over-emotional, even threatening.¹³

The refugees and the music of nostalgia

The revival of interest in Asia Minor music and the proliferation of *cafés-aman* in Athens after the 1922 exchange of populations is hardly surprising. The sheer numbers of refugees created an audience for the music and there were many musicians among them. More importantly, the vocal style and lyrics of the *amanedhes* made them an ideal vehicle for the expression of the refugees' nostalgia for their lost homeland. Already associated in the Greek perception with laments, *amanedhes* were still showpieces for the vocalists, but they were also, as Kazantzakis correctly observed, a cry of bitterness, that rose from their innermost being and spelled, to singer and audience, the orient they had been forced to abandon.

Aksoy (1998) notices an acceleration of borrowed melodies from Turkish music in rebetika songs of the post 1922 period, and there were a large number of recordings of *amanedhes* with Greek or a mixture of Greek and Turkish words. The most earthy and perhaps the most distinctive of the Greek female vocalists of the 1930s, Rita Abadzi, made some of the earliest recordings of *amanedhes* made in Athens. On an HMV recording of "*Manes Karip Hetzaz*" (OGA-285B. A.O. 2306, 1935 (?)) she sings an *amanes* that seems uniquely adapted to the plight of the refugees. It is close in spirit and sentiment to the many Greek folk songs about *xenitia* (exile or foreign lands).¹⁴

Aaaaaaaa
Aaaaaaaa
Ach
Otan ftocheini o anthropos
Aman, o anthropos
einai kaimos megalos
Aaaaaaaa
Einai kaimos megalos
mete kemile
Aman Aman
ton thanato tou karterei
giati den echei tharros
Aaaaman
Aaaaaaaa
Aaaaaaaa
Ach

When a man grows poor
Aman, a man
it's a great sorrow
Aaaaaah!

It's a great sorrow
mete kemile
Aman, Aman!
He waits for death
because he has no courage
Aaaaman!
Aaaaah!
Aaaaah!
Ach!

Another *amanes* that is close not only in spirit but in verse to a traditional moiroloi is the “*Gazeli Nava Sabach*” again recorded by Abadzi in Athens (this recording is included in Schwartz, 1991, and dated by him as ca. 1935).

Prepei na skeftetai kaneis
aman, aman, kaneis
Tin ora tou thanatou, aman
ach, ach, aman, aaaa, aman
aman, aman, tin ora tou thanatou,
aman aman
oti tha bei sti gi
aman...sti mavri gi
kai svinei t'onoma tou, aman
och aman, aman.

A man must think
aman, aman!
at the hour of death,
aman, ach, ach, aman, aaaah, aman!
aman, aman, at the hour of death
aman, aman!
that he'll go into the earth
aman, the black earth
and his name will be erased, aman
ooch, aman, aman!

The fact that *amanedhes* became synonymous with the music of the *café-aman*, despite the wide variety of music recorded by the Asia Minor musicians in the decade following the exchange of populations (Gauntlett, *op. cit.* 13-15) suggests that they were perceived to be the genre most representative of the “oriental” style. The highly florid, melismatic style of the *amanes*, was not unknown in Greek music (the same artists who recorded *amanedhes* often recorded *kleftika* and there were obvious parallels in the music of the Orthodox Church) but it was quite foreign to the light popular music imported from Europe and to the music of the cabarets and musical theater becoming popular in Athens. The *amane*'s non-western sound combined with its associations with lament made it emblematic of all that was to be prized or despised in the maternal inheritance, depending on the contemporary Greeks' point of view.

The debate that arose in the columns of *Ta Athinaika Nea* in 1934 over whether *amanedhes* should be banned in response to a rumor that the Kemalist government had banned them, made these associations clear. (Gauntlett, *op. cit.*). The Turkish ban was said to be part of a campaign of modernisation and Europeanisation. Greeks now had to face the issue of whether Greece could afford to be considered less European by allowing the offending oriental dirges to be sung in its public cafés. The response to a survey conducted by the newspaper was a spirited defense of the genre by “experts” such as the composer

Manolis Kalomiris, on the grounds that *amanedhes* were derived from ancient Greek music via Byzantine. Either Phaidros's article had borne fruit, or the interviewees reflected the tendency of Greek nationalists to accept their "oriental" heritage provided it was passed through the filter of antiquity. In either case, the experts consulted recognised the *amanedhes* as intrinsically more interesting than the music presented in the rival establishments – the *cafés-chantants*. Despite the championing of the music of the *cafés-aman* by respected figures in the music world of Athens, there were calls from the newspaper's own music critic for the banning of the "*amanedhes*" and for raising the taxes on imported recordings of such music from the US.

Debate continued in the Athenian press about the what would probably now be called the "political correctness" of various types of urban music, but the more traditional rebetika songs gradually took center stage as the *amanes* gradually faded from the repertoire, its traces still evident in interpolated exclamations of *aman! aman!*

The revival of Asia Minor style in the United States in the 1940s

To the Greek refugees of Asia Minor, many of whom eventually settled in the United States, the tragic history of Greece during the 1940s must have been viewed as a second catastrophe that mirrored, in many ways, the period of the 1920s. It would not be surprising to find that there was a revival of the music of the Asia Minor refugees during this period. Although it is impossible to make any definitive statements about the reasons for the revival, it is tempting to surmise that the increase in numbers of recording of Asia-Minor recordings during the 1940s in the United States, and especially of *amanedhes* recorded by women singers, reflects a mood of despair and nostalgia in the refugee communities. Asia Minor refugees had been recording in the United States since the early part of the century. A notable feature of the recordings of the 1910s and 1920s is their stylistic innovations. A recording made in 1919 (Columbia 85358) of a "*Manes in Fatmatzore*" by Marika Papagika, for example, could almost be music for a silent movie. Like many of the early recordings she made with her husband Gus, it shows signs of having been "modernised". Compare, for the example, the recording she made of *Smyneikos Ballos* in 1922 (Alma Criolla ACCD802) with the version she recorded in 1928 (Folklyric CD 7005).

The establishment of three new recording companies in the United States devoted largely to producing Asia Minor music seems to be indicative of a revival of interest in the genre. In 1942 the Metropolitan label began producing recordings of singers resident in the United States. The Balkan and Kalliphon companies were established immediately after the war. Virginia Magidou, Katina Karras, Amalia Baka (a Greek Jew from Ioannina) and Victoria Hazan (also a Sephardic Jew who recorded in Greek, Turkish and Ladino) all sang splendid *amanedhes* on the Metropolitan label. What is interesting about the 1940s recordings is that they seem to be performed in a more conservative style. Magidou's recording of the *amanes* "*Pasxv na Ebrv mia Kardia*" ("I Try to Find a Heart") with oud-player Marko Melkon, violinist Nick Doneff and either Garbis or Theo Karras playing kanoun (Metropolitan #166)¹⁵ is a fine example of the late recording style. Magidou's vocal improvisation is in poignant contrast to the lively instrumental accompaniment and there are two brief taximia by Nick Doneff that float above the kanoun and oud, delicately echoing Magidou's voice.

Ooo, aaaaman,
Aman, pascho na evro mia kardia
ax, mia kardia, kardia pou na,
kardia pou na exei pono ...aman aman,
ooo, aaaaman,
oo, aman, kardia
pou na echei pono aman,

eee, aaa, ei,
aman, kardia gia na echei pono,
eee, ei,
aaaa, e,
aman, kardia na 'nai syntrofos,
aax, kardia na 'nai syntrofos,
aa aa aa...aman [etc].

Ooh, aaaman
Aman, I try to find a heart
Ach, a heart, a heart that has..
heart that has pain...aman, aman
Oooh aaaman
that has pain...aman
eeh, aah, eii
aaaah, eeeeh
aman, a heart to be a companion
aach, a heart to be a companion
aaah, aaah, aman, etc.

Among the other stylistically conservative recordings that are notable from this late revival are Amalia Baka's recording of "*Smyneikos Ballos*" (Metropolitan 160), Diamanto Baka's recording of a "*Smyrneiko Matzore*" (Balkan 808), Victoria Hazan's "*Huzam-Gazel*" (Metropolitan 2001-A). The quantity and quality of this last flowering of the Asia-Minor music performed by Greeks and non-Greeks for a largely Greek audience in the United States, together with the establishment of the new recording companies suggests there was a renewed demand for traditional Asia Minor music, particularly for *amanedhes*. Steve Frangos (1994: 58-9) has argued that the old-style *café aman* singers like Madame Coula and Marika Papagika stopped recording in the late 1920s because their music was no longer in fashion. When she did make a come-back, in 1937, none of Papagika's songs were from the Smyrneika or rebetika repertoire. Instead she recorded *dimotika*. Certainly the growth of the recording industry in Greece meant that a large number of Greek recordings were exported to the United States. Still, the recordings made in the 1940s suggest that there was also a demand for American-based performers.

It is tempting to see the demand as a response to the events taking place in Greece. For the displaced Greeks, many of them twice removed from their homeland in Asia Minor, the 1940s was a period, if ever there was one in Greek history, in which Asia Minor music was appropriate. The *gazel* may have been a showpiece for the vocalist in Ottoman music, and for cultural reasons one more often performed by men than women,¹⁶ but the Greek perception of the *amanes* was affected by different cultural attitudes, musical traditions and political events. The association of *amanes* with *moiroloi* and with what was perceived to be the non-western, deeply emotional side of the Greek personality caused the genre to be both popular and suspect. The voices of women singers performing *amanedhes* reminded Greeks of their maternal and oriental heritage, the "universal bitterness" that was, at the same time, "a great treasure". Like the revival of the genre in the 1920s, the 1940s revival was coincident with tragic events in Greek history.

There was another reason, however, why the music of an eclectic, multicultural society remained popular in the United States. The audience for such music may have been predominantly Greek, but the emigré Greeks were living in a society even more heterogeneous than the late Ottoman Empire. In the American cities, emigré communities listened to their own music with nostalgia, whether it was performed by Greeks, Armenians or Jews. Patriotic songs were popular (Frangos, 1994: 50-52) but since Greeks greatly

outnumbered Turks, there was less pressure to assert a form of Greek nationalism based on language or a rejection of the “oriental.”

As a new generation of Greek performers, in Greece and the United States, takes an interest in the music Greeks performed and listened to in the first decades of the twentieth century, it remains to be seen whether the musical “treasure” of the tradition will take its rightful place in the repertoire. If the *amanes* is revived, one wonders how it will be perceived by an audience far removed from the events that made it speak so eloquently to the Greek soul, and from a musico-poetic tradition that demanded a high degree of familiarity with the Ottoman system of *makams* and with classical ottoman poetry.

E-mail: glh3@cornell.edu

REFERENCES

- Aksoy, Bulent. “Ottoman Classical Music and the Art of Improvisation.” in notes to *Gazeller: Ottoman-Turkish Vocal Improvisations on 78 rpm Records*. Kalan CD #067, Istanbul, 1997
- Alexiou, Margaret. *The Ritual Lament in Greek Tradition*. Cambridge, CUP, 1986.
- Auerbach, Susan. “From Singing to Lamenting: Women’s Musical Role in a Greek Village.” In *Women and Music in Cross-Cultural Perspective* (ed. Koskoff). New York, Greenwood Press, 1987.
- Burn, A. R. Revised and annotated translation by Aubrey de Selincourt of Herodotus’ *Histories*, Harmondsworth, Penguin, 1972.
- Caraveli-Chaves, Anna. “Bridge Between Worlds: The Greek Women’s Lament as Communicative Event”, *Journal of American Folklore*, 93:129-57, 1980
- _____ “The Bitter Wounding: The Lament as Social Protest in Rural Greece,” in *Gender and Power in Rural Greece*, ed. J Dubisch, Princeton, Princeton University Press, 1986.
- Faidros, Yorgos. *Pragmateia peri tou Smyrneikou mane i tou par archaiois Manero: Aneureseos tou ailinou kai Ellhnikon iton ka ethimon diasozomenon eiseti para ton Elliniko Lao*, Smyrna, 1881.
- Frangos, Steve. “Marika Papagika and the Transformations in Modern Greek Music.” *Journal of the Hellenic Diaspora*, vol. 20.4, 43-63 (1994).
- Gauntlett, Stathis. *Apomythopoiisi tis rempetikis proistorias*. Diabazo, Athens, 177/28, October, 62-65. 1987.
- _____ “Orpheus in the Criminal Underworld: Myth in and about Rebetika.” *Mantatophoros*. no. 34, pp. 7-48, Birmingham, December 1989.
- Hatzipantazis, Thodoros. *Tis Asiatidos mousis erastai*. , Athens, 1986.
- Herzfeld, Michael. *Ours Once More: Folklore, Ideology and the Making of Modern Greece*. Austin, University of Texas, 1982
- _____ *Anthropology through the Looking-Glass: Critical Ethnography in the Margins of Europe*. Cambridge, CUP, 1987.
- Holst, Gail. *Road to Rembetika: Music of a Greek Subculture*. Athens, Denise Harvey, 1975.
- Holst-Warhaft, Gail. *Dangerous Voices: Women’s Laments and Greek Literature*. London, Routledge, 1992.

- Johansen, H. Fried and Edward W. Whittle (eds.) *The Suppliants of Aeschylus*, Denmark, Gyldendalske Boghandel: Nordisk Forlag, 1980.
- Kazantzakis, Nikos. *Taxideuontas: Italia, Aigiptos, Sina, Ierousalim, Kupros, O Morias*, Athens, Eleni Kazantzakis 1965.
- Kounadis, Panayiotis. "To Smyrneiko Minore: Oi amanedes tis Smyrnis" (1, 2) *Mousiki*, Athens, Reproduced by Centrum voor onderzoek naar en studie van Rebetika en Dimotika, Utrecht, Publication #2 (no date given).
- Nenola-Kallio, Aili. "Studies in Ingrian Lament." *FF Communications*, Helsinki, Academia Scientiarum Finica, 1982.
- Rosenblatt, P.C., Walsh, R. and Jackson, A. *Grief and Mourning in Cross-Cultural Perspective*, New Haven, Human Relations Area Press, 1976.
- Said, Edward. *Orientalism*, New York, Vintage Books, 1978.
- Seremetakis, C. Nadia. *The Last Word: Women, Death and Divination in Inner Mani*, Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1991.
- Schwartz, Martin. (Notes and original recordings) *Greek Oriental Rebetika: Songs and Dances in the Asia Minor Styles. The Golden Years: 1911-1937*, Arhoolie/Folklyric CD # 7005, El Cerrito, California, 1991.
- Soffa, David. (Notes and production) *Marika Papagika: Greek Popular Music in New York 1918-1929*, Alma Criolla Records, ACCD # 802, Berkeley, California, 1994.
- Sultan, Nancy. "Oh Bitter Exile!: Examining the Greek", *Laografia*, Irvine, vol. 11/3, 1994, pp. 6-12.
- Tolbert, Elizabeth. "Women Cry with Words: Symbolisation of Affect in the Karelian Lament", *Yearbook for Traditional Music*, pp. 80-105, 1990.
- Torp, Lisbet. *Salonikios: The Best Violin in the Balkans*, Copenhagen, Museum Tusculanum Press, University of Copenhagen, 1993.

NOTES

1. See, for example, Frangos, 1994: 49).
2. My information on the *gazel* and *makam* comes partly from the excellent cover notes on the two CD's of Gazeller recently released on the Kalan label (Aksoy /Unlu, 1997).
3. If this is so, it would correspond with many other examples of comedy, games, satire and farce that followed laments or tragic genres in other cultures. The satyr plays that followed trilogies of ancient tragedy are an obvious example, and the wake games that followed the singing of laments in Ireland and many other European countries are another. (See Holst-Warhaft (forthcoming) on the politics of mourning).
4. Aksoy (1997:46) mentions Udi Marko Melkon (an Armenian), Izak Al-Gazi (a Jew) and Osep Efendi (an Armenian) amongst the well-known *gazel* performers of the period working in Turkey.
5. Dino Pappas archive. Also see Frangos: 19 : 50-51)
6. A splendid CD of her songs is now available on the Kalan label produced by Cemal Ünlü with notes in Turkish, Greek and English by Bülent Aksoy.
7. The earliest phase of the debate centring on the music of the *café aman* is documented by Thodoros Hatzpantazis (1986) and reviewed in Gauntlett (1987). This phase and the post-Asia Minor Catastrophe are further discussed in Gauntlett (1989).
8. As Herzfeld (op.cit., 1987: 107) notes: "The nationalists' Digenes emerged from an act of preordained miscegenation whose subsequent recurrences were to be regarded as corruptions of the Hellenic ideal, affronts to the national honor (*ethniko filotimo*)". By this logic, orientalizing elements in Greek culture are seen to be subsumed in a timeless past

and become undesirable if they are present in the creating of a historical "beginning". (Herzfeld is using Edward Said's (1975) terminology here, as he makes a distinction between beginnings and origins, between a timeless and passive past or "origin" and a historical struggle for identity or "beginning" (op. cit 108)).

9. Again, Herzfeld (1982) is an important commentator on this question. From Koraes, through Fauriel, Zambelios, Dora D'Istria, N. Politis, Aravandinos and many others, numerous commentators saw the songs as important repositories of Greek identity, supplying an otherwise absent link with an ancient past.

10. As Burn (1954:159) notes, neither the name Linus nor Manerus is Egyptian. Herodotus's own question about the origin of the song may be a reflection of some Greek confusion about rituals that involved dying gods.

11. There is a large and burgeoning bibliography on this subject. The largest cross-cultural study remains Rosenblatt, Walsh and Jackson (1976) which deals with lament in 78 cultures. Even in those cultures where men also lament the dead, the authors observe that women tend to weep longer and louder and compose more structured laments.

12. The association of lullaby with lament is not unique to Greece. In the Finnish-speaking area of Karelia, formerly occupied by Russia and later the Soviet Union, lament/lullabies were common for girl children, whose inevitably miserable lives were considered a fate worse than death. (Tolbert (1990) Nenona-Kallio (1982)). Similarly laments for brides, usually sung by their mothers and female relatives are a common phenomenon not only in Greece but in China and many other societies. What emerges from the cross-cultural comparative studies of laments is that with very few exceptions, they, like lullabies and most other songs that mark rites of passage or stages in the life cycle, are not only women's songs but associated with a certain emotional intensity that may be admired, even sought out by men in times of crisis but at other times may be considered unmasculine, over-emotional, even threatening..

13. There is a large bibliography on this subject. See Holst-Warhaft, 1990, Caraveli Chaves, Tolbert, etc.

14. These songs are frequently about male relatives who have emigrated, In the Greek folk repertoire there are many laments for family members whose death abroad is thought to have been caused by the fact of having left their homeland (Sauinier, 1993, Sultan, 1994).

15. The series begins at 150, so this is probably from 1942.

16. Both Muslim and non-Muslim women did record *gazels*. Aksoy (1997:46) mentions seven of the better-known female artists on his notes including Hikmet Riza, Guzide, Lale and Nerki Hanimlar.