CHAPTER 5

No poetics without inquiry: a proposal for new research methodologies concerning the transmission of musical and lyric forms from medieval al-Andalus into Early Europe *

Ed Emery [SOAS, London]

The purpose of this paper is to propose new methods in the study of medieval lyric forms and their associated musics, specifically as regards the possibility of transfers from medieval al-Andalus into Early Europe. It is devised for the purposes of my own research, but I venture to suggest that the methodology holds true for research into all literatures in all times. That is the spirit in which it is offered

My overall project is to lend a helping hand to demolishing the notion of musically impermeable frontiers between medieval al-Andalus and Early Europe.

We can start with a broad statement of principle. During medieval times there is a well-attested transfer of musical instruments from al-Andalus – what we could call Arab Spain – north of the Pyrenees into Early Europe. For instance, the Arab *'ud* transmutes into the lute; the *naqqara* (paired kettledrums) into nakers; rope drums into timpani; the *rebab* into the *rubeba* / rebec,[1] etc. Logic would suggest that some elements of the musical and lyric forms of al-Andalus also transferred, along with these instruments. Indeed it seems unreasonable to take these two realities as hermetically sealed from each other, behind borders that were impermeable.

Over the years, affinities have been proposed between forms associated with the popular Arabic/Jewish Andalusi dance-song forms known as *muwashshah* and *zajal*, and European forms such as the *ballata*. The term "zajalesque" has been coined to define these European forms.[2] But since the positions advanced in the days of Julián Ribera y Tarragón (1858–1934) and H.G. Farmer (1882–1965)[3] – debates which developed with no little acrimony – in-depth research has been thin on the ground. The time has come to re-address the question. In short, does the marked similarity between these forms, between the *zajal* and the "zajalesque", indicate shared genetic origins, or is it an accident of history?

For the purposes of this paper, to be clear, in both al-Andalus and Early Europe I am focusing on manifestations of lyric / dance song / poetry that often embody an element of emulation, rivalry, contest, or correspondence, between poets (*torneyamen, tenso*, etc). Frequently we are dealing with a form of poetic debate, which might be initiated by an invitation, and taking the form of an exchange in which the replying poets adhere to the rhymes, thematic content and verse-forms of their opponent(s); there may or may not be an implication that the outcome is to be judged by a third party. Such encounters may be written literary exchanges, or they may be oral and improvised. The generation of these lyrics may also take place in a context of community dance, where a principal singer improvises lyrics, and the participants respond with refrains. They may also emerge in processional contexts. These verses may operate broadly on a rhyming principle of AABBB(A) – in other words, an intrinsic principle of "twoness" and "threeness" (AA BBB), with an implication of refrain.

This is the space of what I call agonistic poeteering.

The field of this research extends across more than a thousand years, from the putative origins of the *zajal* in al-Andalus circa 960 CE, through to the *Cantigas de Santa Maria*, and then the Italian sonnet and *ballata*, then through the entirety of the early English carol tradition, down through English mystery plays and eighteenth-century balladry, and arguably down to the national anthem of the United States of America, the "Star-Spangled Banner".

We know from the evidence of Ibn Quzman [1087–1160][4] and Ibn Sana' al-Mulk [1155–1211][5] in the twelfth century that the Andalusi *muwashshah* and *zajal* forms enjoyed enormous popularity heading southwards into North Africa and beyond. North of the Pyrenees, we also know, from the evidence of Raimon Vidal [1196–1252][6] and the Italian poets, that the *canso* and *tenso* forms of the troubadours, and the dancing forms of carol and *ballata*, also hugely popular, established a hegemonic presence in Early European poetry. As above, the question is: were these two realities merely contiguous, or did they have an organic relationship with each other?

This present paper is not partisan, arguing for one view or another. In our present state of knowledge, evidence for the hypothesis is in short supply. But we have to ask ourselves: is this because the evidence is non-existent, or is it perhaps that our academics have lacked the linguistic and musical skills, the breadth of conception and the imagination to go beyond ancient prejudgements?

In order to establish the viability of what we can call "the trans-Pyrenees hypothesis" (in other words, the idea that forms of music, song and dance did indeed cross from medieval al-Andalus into Early Europe) I suggest that it is necessary to go beyond the historical limits of purely musicological or purely prosodic analysis, and to establish a wider range of parameters for a project of broad-based interdisciplinary comparative analysis.

It is, of course, a contested terrain. A former Arabist at SOAS, Jareer Abu Haidar, argues against the trans-Pyrenees hypothesis because, as he says, the thematic concerns of Arab-Andalusi poets – the poetic *topoi* or recurring subject matter – are not to be found among the poets of Early Europe. He announces as much in one of his section headings: "No Arabic Echoes in the Provençal Lyrics".[7] But let us suppose (as seems likely) that an important part of what is being transferred in *muwashshah / zajal* practice is particular melodic motifs or rhythmic pulses of dance song. In that case, this lack of thematic transfer might carry less weight as evidence against the hypothesis. The history of "world music" offers many examples of foreign music genres being adopted with little or no understanding of their thematic content.

In a similar vein, as regards possible transfers of musical practice, Christopher Page wrote a paper on Jerome of Moravia on the history and tunings of the *viella* and the *rubeba*, which he grants is a relation of the Arab *rebab*. Musing on the potential sources of Jerome's tuning theories, and true to the parochialism of English musicology, Page managed entirely to overlook the detailed exposition of the tunings of the *rebab*, *'ud* and other instruments by the ninth century Persian polymath Al-Farabi (CE 872–950/951), in his *Kitab al-Musiqa al-Kabir* ["The Great Book of Music"].[8]

From my own work, and arguing for a maximal breadth of analytical scope, I would suggest that it is impossible adequately to address the complex rhyming schemes of the troubadour *canso* and the Italian *canzone* without taking a measured reading of rhyme schemes and line-fragmentation within the corpus of *zajals* and *muwashshahaat*. Not to do so would be a nonsense, but who among our scholars has gone there?

During my student days, declaring himself averse to speculation, my supervisor would proclaim: "I want *fatti di ferro*" – iron facts." This is precisely the puzzle that we have to confront. Evidences – the iron facts – are few and far between in this field. However, there is a strong sense of generic similarities between poetic cultures. So the first starting point of our business has to be to identify commonalities.

There are a number of evident commonalities between Andalusi strophic verse and the earliest European lyrics.

** We find a distinctive rhyming principle of 2+3. Twoness and threeness. For instance AABBB. This can be developed into further permutations, as for instance, ABCCC; or AABBBA; or ABABCCCAB. Furthermore, individual lines can be broken by internal rhyming. This is a phenomenon that extends across geographical boundaries.

** The lyrics generally have a musical connotation; there is also a clear association with dance.

** Contrafact is a core aspect of conventional poetic practice, in terms of both the text and the music (which means copying, adapting, responding to, the verses of others). This contrafact practice aids diffusion.

** The verses may have an element of debate, duelling, collective judgement, the posing of positions and counter-positions. They may also have an epistolary quality – as correspondence initiated between two or more poets.

** The production of poetry may take place in a public arena – be it a court, a "session", a guild, a poetry society, a wedding etc – and may be performative.

Self-evidently these kinds of commonalities take us beyond the purely musicological or the purely prosodic. They engage questions of dance culture, religious observance, court life, and so on – questions that are broadly sociological, anthropological, and bespeak *comportamenti dei poeti* – what we can call the **behaviours** of poets.

It is in that spirit that I am proposing the development of new methods of analysis for this body of material. To enable us to get a broader sense of the generality of things, and one that is in keeping with the multicultural spirit of our present times.

And, I would add, true to the spirit of the troubadours themselves. Raimon Vidal, author of the troubadours' handbook, the *Razós de trobar*, written in 1210 at the height of troubadour culture, offered his own description of the sociology of the poets.

> "Tota gens Crestiana, Juzeus e Sarazís, emperador, princeps, rei, duc, conte, vesconte, contor, valvasor e tuit autre cavailler e clergues borgés e vilanz... meton totz jorns lor entendiment en trobar et en chanter, o qen volon trobar, o qen volon entendre, o qen volon auzir... "

> "All people wish to listen to troubadour songs and to *trobar* (to compose them), including Christians, Jews, Saracens, emperors, princes, kings, dukes, counts, viscounts, vavassours, knights, clerics, townsmen, and villeins..." [9]

The point is worth stressing: Christians, Jews and Arabs were all listening to troubadour songs, and all were eager to compose them.

No Poetics Without Inquiry!

In short, I am arguing for a practice of *inchiesta poetica*, a **methodology of poetic inquiry**, a process of detailed inquiry and mapping of what poetry is, in both a material and a social sense, and how it develops across time and geography.

In 1995 I wrote a conference paper entitled "No Politics Without Inquiry". This related to revolutionary organisation in factories and places of work. It proposed that projects of working class political organisation were meaningless unless we looked in detail at

questions of *modes of production*, *means of production* and *forces of production* in the very broadest sense.[10]

I re-propose that idea with this present paper. Hence its title: "No Poetics Without Inquiry!"
In 1912 the poet and future fascist F.T. Marinetti was present at the Siege of Adrianopolis, a decisive event in the First Balkan War between the Turks and the Bulgarians. He wrote an extended poem in praise of war. Its title was *Zang Tumb Tumb*, and it has been justifiably claimed as a monument of experimental literature, with "its […] barrage of nouns, colours, exclamations and directions pouring out in the screeching of trains, the rat-a-tat-tat of gunfire, and the clatter of telegraphic messages".[11] In his exuberant and unabashed praise of war (and in 1915 he went on to write, precisely, "In Praise of War") he celebrates the physical materiality of war in the age of its new technologies.

In so doing he takes various things – the siege itself, the mobilisation of the various armies, but also the fixed physical conventions of the book, and the very act of poetry – and disaggregates them into their constituent material parts. The book and its subsequent public performances became a thrilling audio-visual disaggregation of the component parts of "war machine", and also of "poetry machine", and then their reconstitution into project. A fascination with the machine, with its component parts, and particularly an attention to where they derive from, and how they all fit together, in relation to other machines. I have always found this piece rather inspirational.

So let us look at "poetry machine"

Following Marinetti, we can move away from poetry as subjectivism and towards poetry in its functionality, as a system of production. I offer the following definition:

Poetry is an operating system of humanly constructed techniques and artefacts, devised for a variety of different purposes. Its component parts are historically specific in their genesis; they are created at particular moments, and may be long-lived or short-lived according to fashion and to their fitness for purpose; they may be diffused through geography and time, or their usage may remain locally restricted.

Furthermore, the production of poetic forms is a cumulative and collaborative project of many poets, with possibilities of innovation, variation and development performed by individuals. They operate within a sociology that is specific to their times (hierarchies, dependencies, subordination etc) and within which they receive various forms of remuneration for their efforts (patronage, social recognition, spiritual recompense etc).

The new step that I am proposing is one in which we begin to analyse poetry – and particularly the poetries that concern us – as **a system of production**. *Poesia-fabbrica*. Poetry as factory. And that we see individual poems (or dance-related lyrics in our case) in the same way that, dare I say it, we would analyse the component parts, and also the relations of production, of a motor car. What I referred to previously as a process of *inchiesta poetica*, poetic inquiry.

It is no accident that my referents here are Italian. In addition to Marinetti, my methodological proposal develops from a major work of collaborative analysis that young Marxists did in and around Italy's factories during what is referred to as the Hot Autumn of 1969–70, a practice known as *inchiesta operaia* – "workers' inquiry". This practice had its origins in a document prepared by Karl Marx in 1880, which was one of the last pieces he wrote in his life. Published in *Le Revue socialiste* in Paris, it has the splendid preamble: "We […] rely upon socialists of all schools who, being wishful for social reform, must wish for an exact and positive knowledge of the conditions in which the working class – the class to whom the future belongs – works and moves."

Marx's piece is entitled "The Workers' Inquiry".[12] The idea was that activists would go to the factories with a prepared list of detailed questions (one hundred questions, in fact) that they would put to workers, to elicit understandings of the exploitation of the factory working class, which would then provide the basis for further socialist organising.

It is precisely that kind of collective endeavour that I am proposing with this present paper.[13]

The original Marxian model was further elaborated by the comrades of *Classe Operaia* during the 1960s. In 1967 the Turin-based sociologist Romano Alquati presented an in-depth study of the FIAT motor corporation, detailing the extensive networks of supply and servicing that go to make up that individual artefact which is the motor car.[14] Provenances – which bit comes from where. The approach was taken a step further by Raniero Panzieri, with a paper entitled "On the socialist use of the workers' inquiry".[15] Both of these papers are regarded as seminal in the activist school of thought known as *operaismo*.

And then the initiative developed further, into the extraordinary project of militant political-social analysis of workplace and working conditions that was carried out by students and workers at the end of the 1960s and into the 1970s (not least, by the way, into the productive and reproductive roles of women).[16]

How might such methods be applied to medieval poetry?

Following along the lines of Marx's "Workers' Inquiry", I have begun to develop a set of potential questions that can be asked in relation to medieval lyrics, addressing each individual piece of writing. A "poetic inquiry", so to speak. Recognising, of course, that sometimes, for reasons of lack of data, some of the questions will be unanswerable. Those headings are included as the Appendix to this paper.

The headings of the inquiry include typologies of poetic forms, considerations of context and social composition, thematic materials, and musical treatments. Taking our inspiration from terms used in Marxian analysis, our inquiry could be framed in the following terms:

-- Relations of production (in other words, the structure of social relations of production).

-- The mode of production (the historically specific systemic structuring of production).

-- The means of production (i.e. the tools and techniques employed in production).

-- The outcomes of production – namely the commodity – in our case, the poem-machine.

Not forgetting, of course, the eventual circulation of that commodity, which includes systems of transmission.

We could, furthermore, extend these concepts into the notion of poetry as factory – whereby the act of poetry is conceived as a system of production pivoted on the production of social capital. The poetry factory is artisanal at first – with individual poets travelling between places of patronage, seeking means of making a living. But with the passage of time the poetry factory becomes massified, with the establishment of the *puys* (such as Arras), the consistories (such as Barcelona), the Marian fraternities (with their *lauda*) etc.

POETIC MAPPING

Once we have begun to establish a database on the basis of this inquiry, it then becomes possible to take a further step – into the area of **poetic mapping**.

However ethereal its subject matter, poetry is a produced material object. All poetry has a place of production. In medieval times, manuscript transmissions and epistolary transmissions were important, but poetic forms were also carried by the physical personages of the poets themselves.

The lives of poets, troubadours, singers and musicians were driven into movement by a multitude of factors (the need for patronage; political exile; crusades etc), and their peripatetic movements crossed, intersected and aggregated. Poets moved through geographical space, and interacted with others on their way. Questions arise: where were they born; if they travelled, to where did they travel; what were their stopping-off points; and where did they die. All of this signally requires to be mapped

In the current context of global pandemic it is not hard to visualize a project of mapping these movements and processes of poetic dissemination. Something akin to the present interest in virus transmission and the mapping techniques of epidemiology and contact tracing. If we had the resources, then one could imagine creating a **chart of networks** extending (let us say) from 1100 to 1300, which would map the known movements and interrelations of all poets whose works have come down to us.

Such an operation would immediately reveal points of cross-over and intersection, and the existence at any given time of what we could call nodal points of production, points of aggregation, or arenas of influence.

This would be a grand project, and one which, to my knowledge, has not previously been attempted in our field.

THE QUESTIONNAIRE

There is not much that needs to be said about the contents of the questionnaire. A draft version is attached below as an appendix. Apart from obvious prosodic questions such as metre, rhyme structure etc, the questionnaire addresses general sociological, anthropological and political questions designed to map broader contexts. What this methodology seeks to provide is a strong sense of the genesis and diffusion of **poetic behaviours** across time and geography.

BRIEF EXAMPLES:

I shall now offer brief examples of the usefulness of these kinds of approaches.

EXAMPLE: Easy assumptions of the fixity of the Great Court (Magna Curia) of the Emperor Federico II are immediately challenged by the fact that mapping shows it to have been a peripatetic court, perpetually on the move around both Italy and Europe, drawing in a variety of cultural influences and personalities. Furthermore, the historical emergence of the sonnet in the poetic culture of the Federican court (the "Scuola siciliana") has still not been adequately explained. It will be greatly illuminated by a mapping of practices of poetic dueling involving the crowned heads, and the nobility, and commoners, right across the geographic area of our research.[17]

EXAMPLE: Similarly, the facile notion of "the Court of Aragon", which became a hub of poetic activity in the late 1300s, needs to be unpacked and contextualised. Five hundred years of Arab-Muslim culture (714 to 1238); a notable school of classical Arabic poetry; a Jewish community that lasted through to the expulsions of 1492; and a permeable cross-border reality that embraced each side of the borders of what are now Spain and France. As Jeanroy pointed out, when speaking of its troubadour king Alfonso II (1157–96), "The troubadours did not need to cross over the Spain to pay homage to him as he himself had many opportunities to visit their regions".[18]

EXAMPLE: The Andalusi poet, astrologer and biblical commentator Abraham Ibn Ezra (1089 / 1092 – 1164 / 1167) was a prolific writer of *muwashshahaat* (and other) poetry in

the Hebrew language. For the transmission of his work it is important that we understand the extent to which he travelled in his life, carrying his poetics in his physical person from Cordoba to North Africa, Egypt, Palestine, Baghdad, Rome, Salerno, Lucca and Mantova, not to mention Provence and London.[19]

EXAMPLE: A prosopographic approach to the towns of Tudela and Zaragoza in northern Spain reveals significant hubs of poetic activity. For instance, Al-Yazzar as-Saraqusti, active in Zaragoza between 1085 and 1110, wrote courtly panegyrics and satirical-burlesque poetry, as well as *muwashshahaat*. Ibn Bājja (Latinised name Avempace, 1085–1138) was a polymath writing on astronomy, physics, philosophy, medicine and botany. He was noted as a musician, and it is possible that he created music for strophic poetry. One of his enemies, Abu Nasr al-Fath (d. ?1134) reproduces some of his poems, including a panegyric to Ibn Tifilwit, the Almoravid governor in Zaragoza. Al-Aʿmā al-Tuṭīlī or the Blind Poet of Tudela, was one of the best-known strophic poets (*muwashshahaat*) of the Almoravid period in Al-Andalus (1091–1145). Interestingly, from our point of view, according to Ibn Khaldūn (d. 1406) he used to compete with Ibn Baqi in poetic compositions. Tudela was also the birthplace of their contemporary Abraham ibn Ezra (see above), also a *muwashshah* poet.[20]

EXAMPLE: We shall also be able to produce a diachronic account of internal rhyming – how it comes to be used, how it peaks, and how (in Italian poetics) it then loses its popularity. In the case of the *muwashshah*, it is reputedly introduced by the Arab poets Yūsuf ibn Hārūn al-Ramādī [917–1012] of Zaragoza and Ubada Ibn Ma'as-Sama' (late 10th century).[21] It becomes intense in, for instance, the *muwashshahaat* of Ibn Arabi [1165–1240].[22] Internal rhyming (in Italian, *rimalmezzo*) is present as a feature of Provençal poetry and the poetry of the Sicilian School, and of Guittone d'Arezzo.[23] And is then abandoned by Dante and his colleagues, because the pursuit of technical virtuosity in rhyming becomes outmoded, tending to stand in the way of the conveyance of meaning.

EXAMPLE: In discussion of Guillaume de Machaut's "debate poems", Emma Cayley [24] writes of "situating Machaut's debate poems within a long tradition of literary and practical debating". However her "long tradition" is located firmly within the Latin and Christian culture (the scholastic Latin *disputatio* in in medieval universities; the twelfth and thirteenth century *joc-partits* or *jeux-partis* and *tensos* of the troubadours and trouvères; twelfth-century Latin goliardic love debates and the twelfth century *Concilium romarici moncium* (Council of Remiremont), which heralds the later fashion "for love trials"). Arguably, however, the search for origins could have included the Jewish poetic culture of Andalus, where we find the first Andalusi Hebrew didactic debate poems, those of Dunash ha-Levi ben Labrat (920×925–after 985) in the tenth century, and also a highly polished and somewhat scurrilous poetic debate three hundred years later between Todros Abulafia (1247–1306), a poet at the court of Alfonso the Wise, and his associate Phinehas Halevi.[25]

EXAMPLE: A mapping would also bring to the fore the numerous poets who were actively concerned to lay down the rules for poetics, for the correct usage of grammar, and for the best language of poetics. For instance, Raimon Vidal, the Catalan troubadour from Besalù in Northern Spain [1196–1252], wrote an instructional text for poets, on the subject of grammar and poetry, entitled *Razós de trobar* (c. 1210) ["Guidelines of troubadour composition"]. As well as arguing that Occitan is the best language for poetry, he details correct linguistic usages in that language. Looking forwards, this work is replicated in the *De vulgari eloquentia* of Dante Alighieri, which examines the roots of vernacular language and identifies Tuscan as the dialect best suited for illustrious poetry. However, looking backwards (and bearing in mind that Jews were well integrated into the cultural life of Andalus, and not least in Besalù) it would be remiss to leave out of account the grammatical-poetical writings of Abraham Ibn Ezra [b. Tudela c.1089/92; d. 1164/67] and of his older relative Moses Ibn Ezra [b. Granada c.1055–1060, d. post-1138], who wrote a notable text which set out to explain to Hebrew poets how they

should compose their poems, based on the structure of Arabic poems. Fighting to establish Hebrew as a language of poetry, and pitching themselves in relation to Arabic as the previous language of their poetry. Should we understand the *Razós de trobar* as being entirely separate from that Jewish current of thought in Spain?[26]

CONCLUSION

As above, I am proposing this methodology as one that might be adopted for the study of all lyrics, at all times and in all places. However, my immediate concern is for the genres outlined above.

I would be happy to hear from anyone who is interested in developing this kind of work.

A first draft for the questionnaire is attached as an Appendix, below.

E-mail: ed.emery@soas.ac.uk

————————————————

* Paper originally presented at the Medieval and Renaissance Music Conference, Edinburgh, 1–4 July 2020.

NOTES

1. However, Ian Pittaway problematises the *rebab* / rebec connection: "this is conjecture, […] there is no primary evidence linking the two instruments". https://earlymusicmuse.com/rebec/

2. Aurelio Roncaglia, for example, proposes that the Italian *lauda* have their origin, not in the secular dance *canzone* but in the zajalesque form ("la forma zagialesca"). A. Roncaglia, "*Nella preistoria della lauda: ballata e strofa zagialesca", in Il Movimento dei Disciplinati nel Settimo Centenario del suo inizio (Perugia – 1962*), Deputazione di Storia Patria per l'Umbria, Perugia, 1962, pp. 460–75.

3. See for instance Julián Ribera y Tarragón, *La música árabe y su influencia en la española*, Madrid, 1927, and H. G. Farmer, *The Arabian influence on musical theory*, Harold Reeves, London, 1925.

4. Ibn Quzman, 'Muhammad ibn 'Isa, *Cancionero andalusi Ibn Quzman*, ed. Federico Corriente, Poesía Hiperión, Madrid 1989.

5. Ibn Sana' al-Mulk – *Dar al-ṭiraz fi amal al-muwashshaḥat* = Dar at-tiraz: poetique du muwaššah, ed. Jawdat Rikabi, Damascus, 1949.

6. Hugues Faidit and Raimon Vidal, *Grammaires Provençales*, ed. F. Guessard, Paris, 1858, reprinted Slatkine Reprints, Geneva, 1973, p. 69.

7. J. A. Abu-Haidar, *Hispano-Arabic Literature and the Early Provençal Lyrics*, Curzon, Richmond, 2001.

8. Christopher Page, "Jerome of Moravia on the *rubeba* and *viella*", *The Galpin Society Journal*, No. 32, May 1979, pp. 77–98. "Possibly this part of the treatise incorporates material originally written in a country where the rubeba was more familiar; Spain perhaps." See also Tito M. Tonietti, *And Yet It Is Heard: Musical, Multilingual and Multicultural History of the Mathematical Sciences*, Vol. I, Birkhäuser, Basel, 2014, pp. 241 seq.; and Owen Wright, *The Modal System of Arab and Persian Music*, A.D. 1250–1300, Oxford, 1978.

9. See Note 6 above. To which we can add Prof Corriente's observation regarding the Muslim, Jewish and Christian minstrels, singers and dancers described by Juan Ruiz, the archpriest of Hita [c.1283 – c.1350], as active in his days through Castile and other Christian kingdoms of Spain (p. 22 in this volume).

10. Ed Emery, "No Politics Without Inquiry!", 1995. Online at https://notesfrombelow.org/article/no-politics-without-inquiry

11. F. T. Marinetti, *Zang tumb tumb : Adrianopoli, ottobre 1912 : parole in libertà*, Edizioni futuriste di "Poesia", Milano, 1914. See also Caroline Tisdall and Angelo Bozzola, *Futurism*, OUP, Oxford, 1978.

12. Karl Marx, *A Workers' Inquiry*, Freedom Information Service, Detroit, 1973. First published in *La Revue socialiste*, Paris, 20 April 1880. Online at: www.marxists.org/archive/marx/works/1880/04/20.htm

13. A similar approach in the field of social history is the discipline of prosopography, best exemplified in Emmanuel Le Roy Ladurie's microhistorical work *Montaillou* (1975; Penguin, Harmondsworth, 1980).

14. Romano Alquati, *Fiat: Punto medio nel ciclo internazionale* ["FIAT: Mid-Point in the International Cycle"], Centro Frankovich, Florence, 1967; subsequently reprinted in *Sulla FIAT e altri scritti*, Feltrinelli, Milan 1975. For the UK see also Ferruccio Gambino, "Ford Britannica. Formazione di una classe operaia", in *Operai e stato. Lotte operaie e riforma dello stato capitalistico tra rivoluzione d'Ottobre e New Deal*, Feltrinelli, Milano, 1972, pp. 147–90.

15. Raniero Panzieri, "Uso socialista dell'inchiesta operaia", *Classe operaia*, 1965. Trans. Arianna Bove, as "Socialist uses of workers' inquiry". Online at: https://www.generation-online.org/t/tpanzieri.htm

16. For anyone who is interested in these studies, I have gathered some of them in my Red Notes Italian Archive, which is currently lodged at the LSE Library and elsewhere. https://discovery.nationalarchives.gov.uk/details/r/N13683962 . The full listing of the archive is available at www.geocities.ws/rednotesitalianarchive

17. Frede Jensen (ed. and trans.), *The Poetry of the Sicilian School*, Garland, New York, 1985.

18. Alfred Jeanroy, *La Poesie lyrique des troubadours*, cited in *The Poems of the Troubadour Peire Rogier*, ed. Derek E. T. Nicholson, Manchester University Press, Manchester, 1976, p. 40.

19. Abraham Ibn Ezra, *Reime und Gedichte des Abraham ibn Esra*, ed. David Rosin, Jacobsohn, Breslau, 1894; see also Leon J. Weinberger, *Twilight of a Golden Age: selected poems of Abraham Ibn Ezra*, University of Alabama Press, Tuscaloosa and London, 1997.

20. https://referenceworks.brillonline.com/browse/encyclopaedia-of-islam-3. See also www.plato.stanford.edu/entries/ibn-bajja-biography.html. My thanks to Alan Jones for his thoughts on these matters.

21. David Wulstan, "The Muwaššaḥ and Zaǧal Revisited", *Journal of the American Oriental Society*, Vol. 102, No. 2 (Apr.– Jun., 1982), pp. 247-64.

22. Muhyiddin Ibn al-Arabi, *Twenty-seven Muwashshahaat and One Zajal by Ibn Al-'Arabi of Murcia (1165-1240) in a Trilingual Edition [Arabic, Transliteration, English and Castilian]*, ed. and trans. Federico Corriente and Ed Emery, RNR Books, London and Zaragoza, 2004.

23. See Note 17 above. For Guittone, see "Ora parrá s'eo saverò cantare".

24. Emma Cayley, "Machaut and Debate Poetry", in Deborah McGrady and Jennifer Bain (eds.), *A Companion to Guillaume de Machaut*, Brill, Leiden, 2012.

25. Angel Sáenz-Badillos, "Hebrew Invective Poetry: The Debate between Todros Abulafia and Phinehas Halevi", *Prooftexts*, Vol. 16, No. 1, January 1996, pp. 49–73.

26. See Note 6 above.

APPENDIX 1:

THE QUESTIONNAIRE

The following is a (non-exclusive) list of questions that might be posed in regard of individual lyrics.

SOCIAL CONTEXT

Is the poem public?

Is the poem private within a closed group of people?

Does the poet address others as superiors, equals, or inferiors (peer groups, degrees of deference etc)?

Is there an expectation that others will respond to the poem in some way?

Does the poet call other poets to action or debate?

Are other people involved in a cycle of exchanges around the poem (for instance *tenso/tenzone*)?

What other poets are recognizable as being within the social/poetic network of the poem?

Is the poem addressed to a patron?

Does the poem invite judgements on its quality?

Does the poem include elements of praise?

Does the poem include elements of insult?

Is the poem epistolary (sent as a letter)?

Is the poem employed in processional contexts?

PERSONALITY OF THE POET

Is the poet male or female?

What is the assumed sexuality of the poet?

What is the social status of the poet (class position)?

Was the poet subject to persecution?

Does the poet engage in periods of travel?

Was the poet subject to exile?

Does the poet have a concern for the ground rules of poetics (*ars poetica*)?

THEMATIC

Is the content of the poem political?

Is the poem sexually explicit?

Does the poem have propagandist intent?

Is the poem religious in content?

Is the poem anti-religious in content (or against religious establishments)?

Is the poem mystical in content?

Is the poem intentionally obscure in content (for those who know)?

Is the poem secular in content?

Is the poem aware of itself as poetry?

GENRE

Is the poem a textual contrafact (in whole or part)?

Is the poem a musical contrafact (in whole or part)?

Does the poem include proverbial phrases or sayings?

Does the poem seek to elicit a truth on a scientific matter?

Is the poem repentant?

RELATIONS OF PRODUCTION

Does the poem imply recompense or remuneration in a material sense?

Does the poem imply recompense or remuneration in a spiritual sense?

Does the poet depend on patronage?

STRUCTURAL

What is the metrical structure of the poem?

What is the rhyme structure of the poem?

How many verses does the poem have?

Does the poem have an opening refrain?

Does the poem have internally repeated refrains?

Does the poem have internal rhyming?

Does the poem have a concluding refrain?

Does the poem embody a chorus?

What are the distinctive constructs contained within the poem (for instance, style of *incipit*)?

ADDRESSEE

Does the poem invoke an actually existing beloved?

Does the poem invoke an allegorical beloved?

Does the poem address or invoke a deity?

Does the poet call out to the listener/reader (*captatio benevolentiae* / exhortation)?

Is the poem written with a sense of self-justification (for instance in answer to criticisms)?

PLACEMENT

Is the poem contained as part of an authorial anthology (*canzoniere*/*diwan*)?

If so, is the anthology made by the author?

Is the poem part of a recognizable cycle of cognate material?

LANGUAGE

Is the language of the poem formal and classical?

Does the poem employ dialect?

Does the poem feature deliberately obscure language?

Does the poem include text in other languages?

Does the poem declare itself as having hidden meanings (cryptic textual matter)?

DIFFUSION

Is there evidence of the poem having an extended geographic range in its time (diffusion)

What is the known manuscript distribution of the poem?

Is the poem contrafacted by others?

If so, what is the known contrafact distribution of the poem?

_____

Ends